



FUNDED BY THE EUROPEAN UNION

EU REGIONAL TRUST FUND 'MADAD'

"مدد" : الصندوق الائتماني الأوروبي

Regional EU Trust Fund in response to the Syrian Crisis:
“Resilient Communities: Supporting Livelihoods, Education and Social Stability”

INTERNAL M&E REPORT

Activity 3. Technical and Vocational Education and Training

Activity 7. Business Development Services

I. GENERAL DATA

II. ANALYSIS

III. ANNEX I: (INTERNAL M&E FRAMEWORK)

I. GENERAL DATA

1. METHODOLOGY

As part of the effort to strengthen the basic social and economic skills of youth in refugee and host communities in Lebanon and the Kurdistan Region of Iraq, Fursa consortium has carried out a series of training activities (codenamed “A3, A7” in the project’s LogFrame) in the areas targeted by the project.

Throughout the final stages of the project the Fursa staff and their local partners have conducted various M&E tasks with the goal of assessing the effectiveness and the outcome of the project’s activities, and the achievement of its results and objectives. These include the *increase of economic self-reliance of youth in refugee and host communities* (SO1) and the *basic social and economic skills of youth in refugee and host communities are strengthened* (R1.2) (see the Internal M&E framework below).

Given the specific approach livelihood activities, COSV Fursa team in cooperation with COSV M&E MENA office have developed ad-hoc definitions of the project framework indicators, to measure the achievement of these objective and results: for SO1, it has been decided to use a survey in order to assess the percentage of youth participants who reported an increase in their self-generated income. For R1.2, the indicator measured in this report consisted in the number of participants who have effectively applied the knowledge gained through the training programmes.

Two different Means of Verification (MoV) have been developed for the measurement of these indicators. For the SO1 indicator, the Net Attributable Income Change (NAIC) was developed and collected from the sampled beneficiaries while the training sessions were being held April-July 2018 (baseline – reported on the previously shared COSV Internal Report) and again at least three months later, in October 2018 (endline, reported on this paper). The goal of NAIC is to measure any change in the beneficiaries’ self-generated income in the period following the training. The second MoV, named Effectively Applied Knowledge (EAK), was collected in October 2018 with the aim of assessing whether the skills transferred have been used by the beneficiaries, at work and/or in their daily life, after the end of the training programmes.

For both MoVs, a target sample of 330 beneficiaries (110 in Lebanon and 220 in KRI) was set prior to the data collection, for both NAIC and EAK. As per the agreed M&E framework, A3 and A7 beneficiaries were considered for the NAIC. Only A3 beneficiaries were interviewed for the EAK.

Initially, the M&E team aimed to keep balance in sample groups with regard to gender (e.g. 50% men, 50% women) and status. However, situation on the ground did not allow for it as, in order to meet the target of 330 beneficiaries, the M&E staff was forced to interview as many available trainees as possible. Through A3 the project served a total number of 1910 beneficiaries, whilst a total of 768 beneficiaries were involved in A7 activities. Considering a confidence interval of 90% as reasonable for this type of surveys, an error margin of 5 has been defined.

Data has been gathered, processed and stored using KoBo Toolbox. With the goal of offering the most complete and thorough analysis, the collected data have been disaggregated by age range, gender and nationality.

In line with the defined error margin, information collected by field officers has been desk-reviewed so as to single out and eliminate potential errors and biases in the answer given by the interviewees.

For the NAIC survey, the same individuals were asked to provide approximate percentages of their sources of income and to provide an explanation on the response, specifying which sources they refer to. The same questionnaire was administered during the training and then again roughly three months after the training, so as

to compare figures and measure change. Therefore, in order to avoid discrepancies due to approximation, a 20% error margin has been considered while comparing baseline and endline answers, in case these were not motivated by changes in employment status. For example, if one beneficiary reported a self-generated income percentage of 60% in the baseline, and then 70% in the endline, this will be recorded as a 10% increase of self-generated income only if he/she also reports an employment status change that can justify such an increase. If no employment status change has occurred, it will be recorded as “stable”). Similarly, for the EAK survey, the interviewees who reported to have applied the knowledge acquired through the training were asked to provide details to substantiate their claim and make sure the acquired knowledge is directly linked to the Fursa training programmes.

During the baseline of the NAIC, the M&E team in both Lebanon and KRI was able to meet the target goal of 330 interviewees. This was made possible thanks to implementing partners’ cooperation and the availability of the trainees who agreed to being interviewed before or after the trainings sessions. For the endline, partners’ cooperation was again crucial in reaching out and inviting the very same beneficiaries for the second round of interviews. Nevertheless, a number of beneficiaries were not able to travel to the selected venue on the agreed days and could not be interviewed. In addition, the Erbil-based KRI M&E team faced mobility restrictions motivated by the coinciding Iraqi Kurdistan parliamentary elections, held on 20 October 2018. The COSV M&E team was able to mitigate these issues by resorting to phone interviews, both in Lebanon and KRI.

Eventually, the COSV M&E team was able to interview a total sample of 251 trainees (76% of target sample) for the NAIC, whilst 252 trainees (76%) have been interviewed for the EAK.

2. STATISTICAL DATA

NAIC

Region	Total number of sampled beneficiaries	Number of sampled women	Number of sampled men	Number of sampled beneficiaries aged 27 or below	Number of sampled beneficiaries aged 28 and over	Number of sampled refugee beneficiaries	Number of sampled host community beneficiaries	Number of sampled IDP beneficiaries
KRI	164	54	110	148	16	46	66	52
		32,93%	67,07%	90,24%	9,76%	28,05%	40,24%	31,71%
LEBANON	87	51	36	50	37	26	61	0
		58,62%	41,38%	57,47%	42,53%	29,89%	70,11%	n/a
Total	251	105	146	198	53	72	127	52
		41,83%	58,17%	78,88%	21,12%	28,69%	50,60%	20,72%

EAK

Region	Total number of sampled beneficiaries	Number of sampled women	Number of sampled men	Number of sampled beneficiaries aged 27 or below	Number of sampled beneficiaries aged 28 and over	Number of sampled refugee beneficiaries	Number of sampled host community beneficiaries	Number of sampled IDP beneficiaries
KRI	165	70	95	150	15	55	91	19
		42,42%	57,58%	90,91%	9,09%	33,33%	55,15%	11,52%
LEBANON	87	51	36	50	37	26	61	0
		58,62%	41,38%	57,47%	42,53%	29,89%	70,11%	n/a
Total	252	121	131	200	52	81	152	19
		48,02%	51,98%	79,37%	20,63%	32,14%	60,32%	7,54%

II. ANALYSIS

With Activity 3 (A3) – Technical and Vocational Training, COSV aimed at increasing economic self-reliance of youth in refugee and host communities by increasing their soft and vocational skills. Soft skills trainings supported beneficiaries to put in practice their already existing technical skills and increase their employability with the language and computer skills acquired. As for the technical trainings, the goal was to provide beneficiaries with increased technical knowledge and specific skillsets that would facilitate their access to local job markets. The delivered trainings covered the following topics:

Lebanon: Organic agriculture, Organic Waste Composting, Vegetable Crops Production, Irrigation Water Management, Organic Arboriculture, Flower Arrangement, Flower Nursery, Handicraft, Fish Farming, Dairy Production, Food Processing, Soft Skills Trainings.

KRI: Video Editing, Anchoring, Program Research, TV production, Video Shooting, Sound Engineering, Mobile Phone Repair, Sewing, Mechanic Repair, Hairdressing, Soft Skills Trainings.

With Activity 7 (A7) – Business Development Services (BDS), COSV aimed at providing support services to youth in refugee and host communities with the potential to develop a successful business idea that fits within the scope of this project, as described in detail in the previous internal report, drafted in July 2018.

COSV M&E Team chose to monitor the number of youth in refugee, IDP and host communities who have effectively applied the knowledge gained and have increased their economic self-reliance. By increasing the self-generated income as well as the skills and the knowledge, the beneficiaries become more self-sufficient, employable and confident in their research for jobs or open their own businesses.

1. NAIC

Region	Total number of sampled beneficiaries	NAIC Increased	NAIC Stable	NAIC Decreased
KRI	164	33	107	24
		20,12%	65,24%	14,63%
LEBANON	87	23	49	15
		26,44%	56,32%	17,24%
Total	251	56	156	39

Gender

Region	Number of sampled women	NAIC Increased	NAIC Stable	NAIC Decreased	Region	Number of sampled men	NAIC Increased	NAIC Stable	NAIC Decreased
KRI	54	8	42	4	KRI	110	25	65	20
		14,81%	77,78%	7,41%			22,73%	59,09%	18,18%
LEBANON	51	11	32	8	LEBANON	36	12	17	7
		21,57%	62,75%	15,69%			33,33%	47,22%	19,44%
Total	105	19	74	12	Total	146	37	82	27

An observation of the collected data suggests that, overall, men are more likely to find job opportunities and achieve a positive NAIC than women in the months immediately after the trainings. However, in KRI, 18% of the men have reported a negative NAIC, a figure which almost offsets the number of those who reported a positive NAIC. According to the M&E Team investigations, this has been explained with the occasional and temporary nature of the job opportunities typically available to refugees and IDPs in the area.

Age

Region	Number of sampled beneficiaries aged 27 or below	NAIC Increased	NAIC Stable	NAIC Decreased	Region	Number of sampled beneficiaries aged 28 and over	NAIC Increased	NAIC Stable	NAIC Decreased
KRI	148	33	98	17	KRI	16	0	9	7
		22,30%	66,22%	11,49%			0,00%	56,25%	43,75%
LEBANON	50	12	31	7	LEBANON	37	11	18	8
		24,00%	62,00%	14,00%			29,73%	48,65%	21,62%
Total	198	45	129	24	Total	53	11	27	15

The outreach in KRI was highly successful in targeting youth individuals under 27 year of age as only a very limited number of beneficiaries belonged to older age groups. On the contrary, in Lebanon, beneficiaries with specific skillsets and selected in collaboration with micro-project owners were prioritized regardless of their age - a factor which helped maintaining a high level of commitment throughout the training programs (see Madad_Final Training Report_Lebanon&Kri) and a relatively higher employability as a result of the trainings. That said, it should be taken into account that most KRI interviewees defined themselves as “students”, a factor which may account for the more stable NAIC results in that country (as a result of no changes in employment status).

Status

Region	Number of sampled refugee beneficiaries	NAIC Increased	NAIC Stable	NAIC Decreased	Region	Number of sampled host community beneficiaries	NAIC Increased	NAIC Stable	NAIC Decreased
KRI	46	7	33	6	KRI	66	13	43	10
		15,22%	71,74%	13,04%			19,70%	65,15%	15,15%
LEBANON	26	8	14	4	LEBANON	61	15	35	11
		30,77%	53,85%	15,38%			24,59%	57,38%	18,03%
Total	72	15	47	10	Total	127	28	78	21

Region	Number of sampled IDP beneficiaries	NAIC Increased	NAIC Stable	NAIC Decreased
KRI	52	13	31	8
		25,00%	59,62%	15,38%
LEBANON	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
		n/a	n/a	n/a
Total	10	0	0	127

The analysis of NAIC broken down by status does not reveal any particular trend and figures remain relatively similar across the sampled groups. Further data collection, from 6 to 12 months after the end of activities, might return more insightful patterns.

2. EAK

Region	Total number of sampled beneficiaries	EAK (at work or daily life) Yes	EAK (at work or daily life) No
KRI	165	115	50
		69,70%	30,30%
LEBANON	87	51	36
		58,62%	41,38%
Total	252	166	86

Gender

Region	Number of sampled women	EAK (at work or daily life) Yes	EAK (at work or daily life) No	Region	Number of sampled men	EAK (at work or daily life) Yes	EAK (at work or daily life) No
KRI	70	54	16	KRI	95	61	34
		77,14%	22,86%			64,21%	35,79%
LEBANON	51	33	18	LEBANON	36	18	18
		64,71%	35,29%			50,00%	50,00%
Total	121	87	34	Total	131	79	52

The analysis of EAK per gender groups suggests that in Lebanon women were more successful than men in applying the gained knowledge in the months following the training. This is explained with the high versatility of trainings such as Handicraft which exclusively targeted women and provided skills which can be employed both at work and home. For the same reason, one can observe how EAK is higher in KRI than in Lebanon (for both men and women) due to the extensive offer of versatile training modules such as Anchoring (mainly for communication skills), English and Computer.

Age

Region	Number of sampled beneficiaries aged 27 or below	EAK (at work or daily life) Yes	EAK (at work or daily life) No	Region	Number of sampled beneficiaries aged 28 and over	EAK (at work or daily life) Yes	EAK (at work or daily life) No
KRI	150	104	46	KRI	15	11	4
		69,33%	30,67%			73,33%	26,67%
LEBANON	50	25	25	LEBANON	37	26	11
		50,00%	50,00%			70,27%	29,73%
Total	200	129	71	Total	52	37	15

The analysis of age groups reveals two different scenarios. As in the case of NAIC, in Lebanon, older age groups appear more likely (70% vs 50%) to make use of the skills acquired. This tendency can be an outcome of the relatively older age group (see EAK – Gender) of the people who participated in the Handicraft training. In KRI, on the other hand, the versatile training subjects provided to a relatively young group of beneficiaries account for the positive EAK ratio (69%) in this group.

Status

Region	Number of sampled refugee beneficiaires	EAK (at work or daily life) Yes	EAK (at work or daily life) No		Region	Number of sampled host community beneficiaires	EAK (at work or daily life) Yes	EAK (at work or daily life) No
KRI	55	34	21		KRI	91	69	22
		61,82%	38,18%				75,82%	24,18%
LEBANON	26	13	13		LEBANON	61	38	23
		50,00%	50,00%				62,30%	37,70%
Total	81	47	34		Total	152	107	45
Region	Number of sampled IDP beneficiaires	EAK (at work or daily life) Yes	EAK (at work or daily life) No					
KRI	19	12	7					
		63,16%	36,84%					
LEBANON	n/a	n/a	n/a					
Total	19	12	7					

As for the NAIC, the data do not reveal any peculiar trend between different status groups, the only exception being the sample of host community beneficiaries (both in Lebanon and in KRI), which returned a higher EAK ratio than IDPs and refugees. The reason for this is behind the type of training offered: technical and vocational trainings (such as Montage, Video and Sound engineering, BDS, Programme research, Auto maintenance) have seen a larger participation of IDPs and refugees as opposed to soft skill trainings such as English, Computer, Anchoring, which could offer more “all-purpose” skills and were attended by a larger share of host community beneficiaries.

3. CONCLUSIONS:

Following the analysis of the data collected in this phase the following conclusions can be drawn:

- Beneficiaries seem more likely to generate income when trainings are developed and offered in coordination with local businesses which plan to employ the trainees (or a part of them) in a second phase.
This is consistent with previous M&E findings (see Madad_Final Training Report_Lebanon&Kri).
- IDPs and refugees seem more likely to be employed in occasional or seasonal (especially in agriculture) jobs.
- Further data collection 6 to 12 months after the end of the activities might provide more insights into the outcomes of the trainings. This is particularly true for beneficiaries who have yet to conclude their studies and are thus less likely to look for stable sources of income.
- Soft-skill and versatile trainings (e.g. English, Computer, Anchoring) provide skillsets which can be more easily applied outside the workplace. On the other hand, pure vocational trainings such as sewing and mobile phone repairing (KRI) and irrigation water management and fish farming (Lebanon) stand out for having the lowest short-term impact on the beneficiaries in term of EAK. This leads to the following conclusion: technical and vocational trainings can ensure immediate applicability only when linked to job opportunities created in cooperation and coordination with the training provider.